Abstract

Aim To identify how music and singing may be used therapeutically by nurses in caring for older people.

Method A multimethod approach was taken, comprising a search of the Cumulative Index of Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL) and Medline databases, and the extraction of relevant articles from three existing reviews.

Findings Two reviews and 16 research reports were identified, the majority of which were intervention studies. All the studies reported benefits from music or singing for older people. Positive findings related to dementia, specific disorders (osteoarthritis pain, post-operative delirium, sleep difficulties, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease), and older people living at home. Recommendations for nursing were made, although there is a need for clarification on how nursing interventions should be implemented.

Conclusion The evidence base to support the benefits of music and singing is increasing, and it is suggested that nurses may contribute to appropriate interventions and referrals. There is a need for further research, both to support these findings and to explore the nursing role in relation to providing music and singing therapies.

Authors

Ann Skingley, senior researcher, and Trish Vella-Burrows, researcher and music and health project co-ordinator, Sidney De Haan Research Centre for Arts and Health, Canterbury Christ Church University, Folkestone. Email: ann.skingley@canterbury.ac.uk

Keywords

Dementia, health promotion, music, older people, research

These keywords are based on the subject headings from the British Nursing Index. This article has been subject to double-blind review. For author and research article guidelines visit the Nursing Standard home page at nursingstandard.rcnpublishing.co.uk. For related articles visit our online archive and search using the keywords.
It seemed timely to conduct a review of the nursing implications of this form of health promotion.

**Framing the review question: aim of the review**

Despite the existing research and practice examples, the implications for nursing practice in this area are not always clear, especially at a time when evidence-based practice is desirable. One reason for this may be the diversity of ways in which the term ‘arts’ is interpreted. It makes knowledge accumulation of specific interventions problematic. The authors therefore decided to focus on one art form in which they have a major interest – music and singing – and on a client population that reflects their primary nursing experience – older people.

The review question posed was: can music and singing contribute to the health and wellbeing of older people and are they relevant to the role of nurses?

**Method**

The method was based on the mini-review by Griffiths (2002), which is a systematic but focused approach to reviewing the literature. The authors also drew on the work of the Sidney De Haan Research Centre for Arts and Health – where the authors are located – as well as the valuable qualitative work in the area, in line with the growing need to incorporate the participant viewpoint in reviewing the evidence (Dixon-Woods et al 2006).

Searches of the Cumulative Index of Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL) and Medline databases were undertaken. Search terms were based on a breakdown of the question into its ‘population’ and ‘intervention’ terms (facets). Free text and thesaurus terms were used and combined in the searches as follows: ‘aged’ or ‘old’ or ‘elderly’ and ‘music’ or ‘singing’. Limits were applied to restrict the search to studies published since 1997 (representing the period in which interest in this area has been evident) in journals relevant to nursing (in order to inform practice) with full-text availability.

In addition, relevant studies (those identified using similar criteria, but including two papers not available electronically) were extracted from:

- A recently completed systematic review of singing and health (Clift et al 2008).
- A review undertaken for a study evaluating singing groups for older people (Bungay and Skingley 2008), as well as the findings from this study.

- A review of the literature undertaken for a PhD by one of the authors (TV-B), evaluating the potential benefits of singing for people with dementia and their carers.

Parameters were set in the selection of studies for review as outlined in Box 1.

**Findings**

Sixteen individual studies met the inclusion criteria. In addition, two reviews of research were located, but were insufficient alone in their coverage to answer the question. One of these (Kneafsey 1997), included music therapy as well as ‘everyday’ music and was also at the outer edge of the acceptable publication date span. It therefore required supplementation. The second study (Sung and Chang 2005) reviewed articles with a limited focus on preferred music and its effect on decreasing agitated behaviours in older people with dementia in long-term care facilities. It also included many studies outside the date range of this review. This therefore was also inadequate in providing an answer to the review question.

The 16 studies fell broadly into the intervention studies category – experimental, quasi-experimental and case-control studies, such as those of Bauldoff et al (2002), McBride et al (1999) and Göttel et al (2002).

Non-intervention studies (qualitative interviews, ...
more structured questionnaires and other methods, for example observation and video recordings) included those by Pickles (2003), Hays and Minichiello (2005) and Sixsmith and Gibson (2007). There were noticeably fewer of this type of study in the nursing literature.

The research located could be categorised according to the effect of music on different areas of functioning:

- People with dementia.
- Specific disorders – hip and knee surgery, osteoarthritis, sleep problems and COPD.
- Everyday life.

**Music for people with dementia**

Of the reviews, Kneafsey’s (1997) study of the use of music in older people’s care settings suggested that music may have a positive effect on the behaviour of people with dementia. However, the review was not conducted systematically, and the number of articles that considered music other than music therapy was low.

The second review (Sung and Chang 2005) investigated eight studies reporting the effect of music on agitated behaviour in older people with dementia. It noted relatively consistent findings in terms of a reduction in some types of behaviour after listening to preferred music. Methodological weaknesses were noted in some of the articles reviewed, including small sample sizes and variation in the application of the intervention. Nevertheless, the authors suggested that the use of preferred music has the potential to provide a therapeutic approach to the care of older people with dementia.

A further six individual studies related to people with dementia (Table 1). One of these referred to ‘restrained patients’ (Janelle et al 2004), with the inference of dementia. Sample numbers in the studies were generally small (varying from 2 to 68 patients). Four studies evaluated a musical intervention on observed behaviour. They illustrate well the difficulties of researching this patient group, where the meanings of responses must be inferred. Two used a standard agitation scale (Remington 2002, Hicks-Moore 2005), while the remaining two (Götell et al 2002, Norberg et al 2003) – also those with the smallest sample numbers – relied on video recording or researcher observation, with a potentially greater degree of subjectivity in the analysis.

As in the case of the review articles, interventions varied, although the focus on preferred music, often identified through carers or relatives, was notable. One study (Götell et al 2002) included caregiver singing. Two others (Remington 2002 and Norberg et al 2003) compared music with other interventions, in addition to a control group.

Another study in this group (Sixsmith and Gibson 2007) interviewed people with dementia and their carers, exploring the meaning and benefits derived from engaging with music for this group of people.

All studies reported less agitated behaviour and greater interaction and co-operation. Where music was compared with other interventions, for example hand massage, touch and object presentation, there appears to be no greater benefit in combining the interventions. Caregiver singing was found to be particularly beneficial in the analysis by Götell et al (2002). There was a broad consensus on the benefits of introducing music as an intervention for this client group, noting the relative ease of administration by professional and lay carers.

Although little specific guidance appears in the literature, two studies suggest that training in care delivery and in interpreting client response should be given to support its integration into nursing care (Remington 2002, Norberg et al 2003). However, this recommendation was not expanded on in either study.

**Music for specific disorders**

Five articles considered the use of music in alleviating specific conditions (Table 2). Although four of these studies were randomised controlled trials (RCTs), sample numbers were small (ranging from 24 to 66 participants) and all used convenience sampling. Power calculations – a procedure used to estimate sample size requirements – were recorded for only two studies (Bauldoff et al 2002, Lai and Good 2003).

Interventions, in terms of the type, duration and mode of music listening, were variable.

Findings, although overwhelmingly positive, were again reliant largely on self-reporting. Visual analogue scales, which require participants to rate how they feel, were used in two studies (McCaffrey and Freeman 2003, McBride et al 1999), while self-reporting by poor sleepers, as used by Lai and Good (2005) can, as the authors suggested, lead to underestimates of sleep duration. McCaffrey and Locsin (2004) relied on nursing documentation, which arguably may not represent actual practice. Conclusions should therefore be treated with caution.

**Music in everyday life**

The four studies relating to the value of music and singing for older people living in the community suggest a wide range of self-reported benefits. Pickles (2003) investigated the tastes and preferences of individuals (aged 58-86 years) attending University of the Third Age (U3A) music groups in the UK using a structured
**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Aim/question/focus</th>
<th>Setting and sample</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Recommendations for nursing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Götell et al (2002)</td>
<td>Analysis of caregiver singing</td>
<td>Five caregivers and ten patients (80-90 years) of dementia in a dementia unit in Sweden</td>
<td>Interviews and behavioral observation</td>
<td>caregiver singing was less aggressive than the control group. Singing in a dementia unit enabled caregivers to interact more with patients. Singing was a therapeutic intervention in dementia care.</td>
<td>Singing can be used as a therapeutic intervention in dementia care.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remington (2002)</td>
<td>To examine whether modifying environmental stimuli by the use of calming music and hand massage affects agitated behaviour in people with dementia</td>
<td>68 people with dementia in the United States</td>
<td>Four-group repeated measure experimental design</td>
<td>Both interventions reduced agitation, especially administered by professional caregivers.</td>
<td>Interventions requiring little training and easily administered by professional caregivers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norberg et al (2003)</td>
<td>To compare the reactions of patients with dementia to three kinds of stimulation: music, touch, and object presentation</td>
<td>Two patients in the final stages of dementia (80 and 84 years) in Sweden</td>
<td>In-depth interviews</td>
<td>Patients reacted differently to music, touch, and object presentation. Caregivers should be trained to notice patient reactions to different kinds of stimulation.</td>
<td>Caregivers should be trained to notice patient reactions to different kinds of stimulation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janelli et al (2004)</td>
<td>To explore the effect of music on restrained patients</td>
<td>30 restrained hospitalised patients (65-93 years)</td>
<td>Experimental design</td>
<td>No significant differences were found between the three groups. Listening to music was an appropriate nursing intervention for restrained patients.</td>
<td>Listening to music was an appropriate nursing intervention for restrained patients.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hicks-Moore (2005)</td>
<td>Does relaxing music played during the evening meal reduce the cumulative incidence of agitated behaviours displayed in a group of nursing home residents with dementia?</td>
<td>30 nursing home residents with dementia (70-101 years) in a special care unit in Canada</td>
<td>Quasi-experimental design</td>
<td>Agitated behaviour decreased significantly when music was played compared with no exposure. Music should be incorporated into the daily care regimen.</td>
<td>Music should be incorporated into the daily care regimen.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixsmith and Gibson (2007)</td>
<td>To explore the role of music in the everyday life of people with dementia</td>
<td>26 people with dementia in residential homes or in residential care settings</td>
<td>In-depth interviews</td>
<td>Music led to enhanced feelings of empowerment, social interaction, and sense of belonging. Music can be a powerful medium for empowering caregivers, in their own roles in society.</td>
<td>Music can be a powerful medium for empowering caregivers, in their own roles in society.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Summary:**
- Music can be a powerful therapeutic intervention in dementia care.
- Caregiver singing was less aggressive and more cooperative with patients than the control group.
- Both interventions (music and hand massage) reduced agitation in people with dementia.
- Patients reacted differently to music, touch, and object presentation.
- Listening to music was an appropriate nursing intervention for restrained patients.
- Agitated behaviour decreased significantly when music was played.
- Music led to enhanced feelings of empowerment, social interaction, and sense of belonging in people with dementia.
questionnaire, with scope for additional comments. Respondents related a number of examples of how music added value to their life experiences, especially in helping to overcome the difficulties attributed to old age. U3A members may not be representative of the broader community of older people because they are characteristically very active. However, knowledge of the nature of taste and perceived benefit, and impediments such as poor hearing, to the enjoyment of music may inform those setting up community music groups for patients.

A more qualitative approach to eliciting the personal meaning and importance of music to older people was used in an Australian study (Hays 2005, Hays and Minichiello 2005). Data were collected from qualitative interviews with 38 individuals aged 60–98 years, and two focus groups. A variety of responses were given in answer to questions on the value of music, including its contribution to maintaining wellbeing, expressing spirituality, independence, reduction in loneliness and isolation, breath control and stress reduction.

Hays (2005) commented that if health professionals were aware of the potential of music for some older people, they would be in a better position to contribute to improving and supporting quality of life and wellbeing.

The final two studies to inform this review investigated the value of community singing for older people. Cohen et al (2006) recruited 160 volunteers aged over 65 years and allocated them to either a chorale (weekly singing for 30 weeks and several public performances) or usual activity. Measures at one year revealed statistically significant differences between the two groups on depression and loneliness scales and with other health problems. The intervention group achieved a more positive score than the control. It was also noted that the singing group became more socially active in other areas of their lives. Cohen et al (2006) commented on the important health promotion and prevention effects of these findings, together with a reduction in risk factors for becoming dependent on long-term care.

### TABLE 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Aim/question/focus</th>
<th>Setting and sample</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Recommendations for nursing made in the study</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>McCaffrey and Liossin (2004)</td>
<td>To determine the effect of music on acute delirium and confusion in older people undergoing elective hip and knee surgery.</td>
<td>66 individuals aged 65+ years in a large tertiary care centre in southeast Florida.</td>
<td>Randomised controlled trial (RCT) comparing music listening with standard care.</td>
<td>Significant decrease in the number of episodes of post-operative confusion in music group compared with controls.</td>
<td>Music is an inexpensive, non-invasive therapy that can be initiated by nurses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McCaffrey and Freeman (2003)</td>
<td>To study the effect of listening to music on pain in osteoarthritis.</td>
<td>66 community dwelling adults aged 65+ years.</td>
<td>RCT comparing music listening with 20 minutes of sitting quietly.</td>
<td>Pain levels decreased in music group compared with controls.</td>
<td>Intervention is appropriate for nurses caring for this patient group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lai and Good (2005)</td>
<td>To test the hypothesis that listening to music at bedtime results in better sleep quality compared with no music listening.</td>
<td>60 older people in Taiwan with sleep disorders.</td>
<td>RCT comparing music listening with no music listening.</td>
<td>Sleep quality improved in intervention group compared with controls.</td>
<td>Music is a quick, easy and low-cost intervention that can be used by nurses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bauldoff et al (2002)</td>
<td>To determine if music promotes adherence to a walking regimen post-pulmonary rehabilitation for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD).</td>
<td>24 patients aged 68+ years with moderate-to-severe COPD.</td>
<td>RCT comparing walking while listening to music with walking without music.</td>
<td>Improved functional performance in participants using music compared with controls.</td>
<td>Music is an inexpensive and easily implemented addition to a rehabilitation programme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>McBride et al (1999)</td>
<td>To examine the feasibility of using music as an intervention for dyspnoea and anxiety in patients with COPD.</td>
<td>24 people, mean age 69 years, experiencing baseline dyspnoea, living at home in Canada.</td>
<td>Repeated measure study comparing measures with up to five weeks after music listening.</td>
<td>Significant decline in anxiety and dyspnoea following use of music at week 2, but not at week 5.</td>
<td>Listening to music is a potential intervention for relieving dyspnoea and/or anxiety in people with COPD.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Bungay and Skingley (2008) explored the potential benefits of participation in community singing groups for older people. Interviews with participants and other stakeholders from six groups elicited a number of areas where older people appeared to benefit. These included: enjoyment, social interaction, physical improvement (in terms of breathing and co-ordination), memory and recall, and cognitive stimulation. Recommendations were mainly directed towards those setting up and running such clubs. However, many are applicable to health settings where the introduction of music is being considered.

**Limitations**

The review was based on the ‘mini review’ method (Griffiths 2002), which is purposely limited in scope in order to appeal to busy practitioners. Exclusion criteria have been applied by the authors. For example, work not available either electronically or in the Sidney De Haan Research Centre for Arts and Health and ‘grey’ (unpublished) literature were excluded. This inevitably limits the generalisability of the review. However, the diversity of interventions and client groups featured means that the application of findings to any situation should be undertaken in conjunction with clinical judgement. A full systematic review would provide more robust guidelines for practice in this area.

**Discussion and recommendations for nursing practice**

Evidence relating to the contribution of singing and music to the health and wellbeing of older people appears plentiful. However, it is diverse and small-scale and therefore difficult to synthesise. Most convincing is the research relating to interventions with people with dementia, where one study (Götell et al 2002) found singing to have additional benefits to music. Several recommendations suggest that healthcare professionals may use music or singing relatively easily, particularly to reduce agitated behaviour in this client group.

Little specific guidance on implementing music or singing was offered, although the issue of suitable preparation and training, and the potential need for courses to support healthcare workers, was raised by two authors (Remington 2002, Norberg et al 2003). There may be a need for courses such as the module on therapeutic communication for professional carers in care homes in east Kent, which is currently provided by Canterbury Christ Church University.

The introduction of music and singing to specific areas of health care has a less robust evidence base because of the limited numbers of studies in any one area. However, one unifying factor across a number of these is the reference to an individual’s preferred taste in music or singing in measuring benefits. This suggestion regarding individual musical taste is reinforced by the variety of interventions and benefits – physical, psychological, social and spiritual – reported in the literature. It is an argument that supports the inclusion of music, if appropriate, in patient assessments and care plans (Hicks-Moore 2005).

---

**References**


Any reference to the potential for nurses and other health professionals to refer individuals to community singing groups is absent from the literature.

There appear to be few empirically based contraindications to the use of music and singing with older people discussed in the literature. However, Hays and Minichiello (2005) suggested that music could potentially have a negative effect. For example, it could evoke suicidal thoughts, prejudice, sadness or negative feelings. These researchers commented that content analysis of song lyrics might be advisable in the consideration of material to be used, to uncover and screen any potentially negative values and messages being conveyed.

There are a number of areas where further study is needed. First, most of the studies located for this review focused on music, largely a passive process, rather than singing, by its nature participative. Research suggests that neurophysiological responses to music and to singing may differ. Two studies (Bailey and Davidson 2004, Kreutz et al 2004) have identified enhanced benefits (via hormonal and immunological systems) from singing when compared with listening to music, but studies are needed to clarify these differential effects in older people.

Second, reaction to music is an intensely personal experience (Hays and Minichiello 2005) and there is mixed, or little, evidence for the effects that age, social class, musical or other background have on an individual’s potential to benefit from music or singing. Were such effects to become measurable, they might be used to inform a nursing assessment.

Third, there are few data on how nurses might promote successful interventions. Further large-scale randomised controlled trials would provide more robust evidence for this and of the measurable effects of singing and music on particular groups of individuals. Testimonies from older people would add to the knowledge base regarding how individuals may respond in less ‘measurable’ ways.

Conclusion

There is growing evidence to support the benefits of music and singing to the health and wellbeing of older people. Much of the research discussed here includes implications for nursing in a variety of settings, in particular the introduction of preferred music or singing, the latter especially in the case of dementia. Less explicit, but worthy of consideration for older people living at home, may be referral by community nurses to community chorales or singing groups, especially for individuals who are socially isolated.

However, there is a need for further research to refine the evidence in this area of health promotion and the nurse’s role.

IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE

- Nurses should consider using music and/or singing as an intervention for older people, to either maintain wellbeing or support specific conditions, for example dementia.
- A nursing assessment should include the individual’s music preferences.
- Appropriate training in the use of music should be considered where available.
- Consideration should be given to the referral of appropriate individuals to community music or singing groups.

NURSING STANDARD

January 13 :: Vol 24 No 19 :: 2010